| Table 1. Summary of Controlled Trials of Counseling for Physical Activity |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |
|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|---|
| Study,<br>Authors,<br>Year  | Study Design   | Patients   | Theory   | Provider<br>Education &<br>Materials                   | Protocol   | Provider<br>Adherence  | Short-term: less than 6 months   | Long-term: 6 months or more  | <b>Quality Comments</b>   |
| Counseling  | vs. Usual Care   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |
| Physically<br>Active for<br>Life,<br>Goldstein,<br>1999 (20)              | RCT of 24<br>community-based<br>primary care<br>practices matched<br>by size (34<br>physicians). PA<br>only. | older. Intervention: n=181; mean age, 65 years; baseline stages: 13% precontemplative, 31% contemplative, 56% preparation stage; 12% nonwhite. Control: n=174; mean age, 66 years; baseline stages: 17% precontemplative, 33% contemplative, 50% preparation stage; 20% nonwite.                       | (5 stages), social cognitive theory, health education. | Training, pretested manual, and poster for patients.   | 5 min. stage-based<br>advice on benefits;<br>assisted with self-<br>efficacy and<br>barriers;<br>community<br>resources; written<br>PA prescription;<br>follow-up visit at 1<br>mo. for adjusted<br>prescription.  | Intervention: 99% received PA prescription, 77% received follow-up prescription. Control: 1% received PA prescription                          | At 6 weeks, 28% of intervention patients met HP goal vs 21% of controls (difference of 7%; CI, -3% to 15%).  | At 8 months, 28% of intervention patients met HP goal vs 23% of controls (difference of 5%; CI, -6% to 14%).   | Good quality Met all criteria. Follow- up: 95% at 6 weeks, 88% at 8 months.   |
| Norris, 2000<br>(22)  | care physicians in a staff-model HMO,  | Adults over age 30 scheduled for well visits. Intervention: n=384 adults; mean age, 53; baseline stages: 2.6% precontemplative, 51.3% contemplative, 46.3% action; 11% nonwhite. Control: n=463; mean age, 57; baseline stages: 3.4% precontemplative, 46.8% contemplative, 49.8% action; 8% nonwhite  | Transtheoretical (3 stages).                           | 1 hour training,<br>follow-up calls with<br>providers. | Stage-based advice<br>on benefits; PA<br>preferences;<br>assisted with<br>barriers, self-<br>efficacy, and self-<br>management. Gave<br>stage-based hand-<br>outs; agreed on<br>written goal.<br>Follow-up call at<br>one month and<br>mailed educational<br>materials | Intervention: 94% were counseled, 90% of these received PA prescription. Control: 65% were counseled, 81% of these received a PA prescription. |  |  | Fair quality. Follow-up: 93% at 6 weeks, 97% at 6 months. Baseline differences in preveious PA counseling. During the trial, control clinicians increased PA counseling rate. |
| Smith , 2000<br>(26)  | controlled trial of patients in 27   | Active and inactive adults ages 25 to 65 years old. Prescription Only Intervention: n=380; mean age, 43 years; median total PA, 95 minutes; Prescription and Booklet Intervention: n=376; mean age, 43 years; median total PA, 120 minutes; Control: n=386, mean age, 42 years; total PA, 145 minutes. | Transtheoretical (5 stages).                           | 20-30 mins of training.                                | Advice, provided<br>PA prescription.<br>Stage-based<br>booklets sent to<br>random sample.  | Intervention: 62% received PA prescription. Inferred 468 of 471 sedentary patients for 99% adherence. Control: Not reported.                   | 6-10 weeks in the prescription plus booklet vs control: 31% met HP goal vs. 27% control (difference of 4%; CI, -5% to 12%); 46% increased 60 minute weekly vs. 35% control (difference of 11%; CI, 2% to 20%; <i>P</i> =0.02). In the prescription only vs | Among inactive patients at 7-8 months in the prescription plus booklet vs control: 24% met HP goal vs 17% (difference of 8%; CI, 0% to 15%; P=0.053); 36% increased 60 minute weekly vs 27% control (difference of 9%; CI, 0% to 17%; P=0.06). In the prescription only vs control: 22% met HP goal vs 17% (difference of 5%; CI, 3% to 12%); 32% increased 60 minutes weekly vs 27% control (difference of 4%; CI, -4% to 13%). | Fair quality Follow-up: 92% at 6-10 week, 83% at 7-8 months. Baseline differences in PA levels.   |

| Study,<br>Authors,<br>Year                   | Study Design   | Patients   | Theory                         | Provider<br>Education &<br>Materials  | Protocol  | Provider<br>Adherence   | Short-term: less than 6 months   | Long-term: 6 months or more  | <b>Quality Comments</b>  |
|--|--|--|--------------------------------|---|---|---|--|--|--|
| Kerse,<br>1999 (21)                          | general practices (42 physicians).   | Adults age 65 and older.<br>Intervention: n= 135; mean<br>age, 73 yrs; total activity,<br>281 minutes/week. Control:<br>n= 132; mean age, 74 years;<br>total activity, 328<br>minutes/week | Not reported                   | 3 hour seminar with<br>exercise<br>physiologist,<br>sociologist, and<br>geriatrician; 15<br>minutes follow-up<br>detailing; prompt<br>card. | Counseling for PA<br>and social activity.<br>Other counseling<br>techniques not<br>reported.  | Intervention: 32% of patients reported discussing PA with physician. Control: 21% reported discussing PA with physician   |  | At 1 year, intervention patients increased walking 44 min/week more than control patients (CI, 4 to 84 min/week; <i>P</i> =0.03.   | Fair quality Follow-up: intervention, 90% at 1 year; control, 85% at 1 year. Counseling interventions not clearly defined, low provider adherence. |
| Change of<br>Heart,<br>Steptoe,<br>1999 (23) | practices (20 nurse  |  | Transtheoretical (5 stages)    | 3 day training with<br>refresher day at 6<br>months.  | Stage-based advice<br>on benefits and<br>attitudes; assisted<br>with incentives, self<br>monitoring, relapse<br>prevention, barriers.<br>Telephoned patients<br>between counseling<br>sessions. Mailed<br>educational<br>materials. | Not reported  | At 4 months, intervention patients had 13 (20-minute) activity sessions/4 weeks vs 9 sessions/4 weeks in controls (difference of 3.7; CI, 1.3 to 6.3 sessions/4 weeks; $P < 0.05$ ). |  | Fair quality Follow-up: intervention, 65% at 4 months, 54% at 1 year; control, 74% at 4 months, 62% at 1 year                                      |
| Burton, 1995<br>(19)                         | RCT of 4,195<br>Medicare patients<br>in 119 practices.<br>PA, immunization,<br>smoking, drinking | Sedentary Medicare<br>beneficiaries. 61% age 65 to<br>74 years; 33% age 75 to 84<br>years; 6% age 85+ years.<br>Intervention:n=2,105;<br>Control: n=2,090                                  | Suggested but<br>not directed. | Continuing medical education credits on preventive and counseling visits. Educational materials.  |   | Intervention: 89% of physician encounter forms contained PA discussion note. Inferred that up to 39% of patients attended follow-up counseling visit that included PA. Control: not reported. |  | At 2 years, 42% of intervention patients in good health vs 42% control group patients in good health increased PA. 20% of intervention patients in poor health increased PA vs 18% of control patients in poor health (difference of 3%; CI, -4% to 9%). | Fair quality Follow-up: intervention, 75% at 2 years; control, 73% at 2 years. Counseling interventions not clearly defined                        |

| Study,<br>Authors,                                    | Study Design  | Patients  | Theory                     | Provider<br>Education &   | Protocol  | Provider<br>Adherence  | Short-term: less than 6 months   | Long-term: 6 months or more   | <b>Quality Comments</b>  |  |
|---|---|---|----------------------------|---|---|--|--|---|--|--|
| Year  | of different interver   | tions (no varial com)   |                            | Materials   |   |  |  |   |  |  |
| •   | Comparison of different interventions (no usual care)   |   |                            |   |   |  |  |   |  |  |
| Activity<br>Counseling<br>Trial, 2001<br>(25, 33, 34) | RCT of 874 adult patients from 11 primary care settings (51 physicians, 2 physician assistants, 1 nurse practitioner). PA only. | Intervention: Advised group: n=292; avg age, 51 years; Assisted group: n=293; avg age 52 years; Counseled group: n=289; avg age 52 years. | theory.                    | advice training;<br>health educators<br>received assist and<br>behavioral<br>counseling training. | advice (Advised Group); initial advice and 30-40 minutes of behavioral counseling plus telephone follow-up (Assissted Group); initial advice, behavioral counseling, and biweekly telephone counseling for first 6 weeks, monthly calls thereafter, weekly class offerings (Counseled Group). | Group: 18<br>minutes over<br>24 month<br>study; Assisted<br>Group: 2.7<br>hours;<br>Counseled<br>Group: 8.9<br>hours for<br>women, 5.6<br>hours for men. |  | At 6, 12, and 24 months, no difference in total energy expenditure for male or female patients with one exception. Women in the counseled group had an average total energy expenditure of 33.3 kcal*kg-1*day-1 at 6 months vs 32.7 kcal*kg-1*day-1 for women in the assisted group (difference of 0.54 kcal*kg-1*day-1; CI, 0.07 to 1.0; adjusted <i>P</i> =0.01). | Good quality. Follow-up: 91% at 24 months, 78% completed fitness test (Vo2 max) at 24 months Met all criteria                          |  |
| Swinburn, 1998 (24)                                   | RCT of 491 patients of 37 providers in 2 New Zealand urban centers. PA only.  | Sedentary adults. 50% had at least one coronary heart risk factor. Intervention: n=239; Control: 252.                                     | management (goal setting). | 1 training session<br>on assessing and<br>prescribing<br>physical activity.                       | Advice (avg. 5 minutes) and written PA prescription. Stage-based booklets sent to random sample. Control group received advice only.  | Not reported.  | More patients receiving advice and a written PA prescription performed any activity (51% to 86%, an increase of 35%) at 6 weeks vs patients who received only advice (56% to 77%, an increase of 21%) (difference of 14%; CI, 6% to 22%; <i>P</i> =0.004). No difference in the number of increased minutes spent in PA for the groups, 156 minutes per 2 weeks. |   | Fair quality. Follow-up: Intervention: 91% at 6 weeks; Control: 94% at 6 weeks. Intervention not well defined. Adherence not reported. |  |